

Going for Broke

Insolvency Tools to Support Cross-Border Asset Recovery in Corruption Cases

Jean-Pierre Brun
Molly Silver



WORLD BANK GROUP



the global voice of
the legal profession*



Stolen Asset Recovery Initiative
The World Bank • UNODC

© 2020 International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank
 1818 H Street NW, Washington, DC 20433
 Telephone: 202-473-1000; Internet: www.worldbank.org

Some rights reserved

1 2 3 4 22 21 20 19

This work is a product of the staff of The World Bank with external contributions. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this work do not necessarily reflect the views of The World Bank, its Board of Executive Directors, or the governments they represent. The World Bank does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this work. The boundaries, colors, denominations, and other information shown on any map in this work do not imply any judgment on the part of The World Bank concerning the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

Nothing herein shall constitute or be considered to be a limitation upon or waiver of the privileges and immunities of The World Bank, all of which are specifically reserved.

Rights and Permissions



This work is available under the Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 IGO license (CC BY 3.0 IGO) <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/igo>. Under the Creative Commons Attribution license, you are free to copy, distribute, transmit, and adapt this work, including for commercial purposes, under the following conditions:

Attribution—Please cite the work as follows: Brun, Jean-Pierre, and Molly Silver. 2020. *Going for Broke: Insolvency Tools to Support Cross-Border Asset Recovery in Corruption Cases*. Stolen Assets Recovery series. Washington, DC: World Bank. doi:10.1596/978-1-4648-1438-9. License: Creative Commons Attribution CC BY 3.0 IGO

Translations—If you create a translation of this work, please add the following disclaimer along with the attribution: *This translation was not created by The World Bank and should not be considered an official World Bank translation. The World Bank shall not be liable for any content or error in this translation.*

Adaptations—If you create an adaptation of this work, please add the following disclaimer along with the attribution: *This is an adaptation of an original work by The World Bank. Views and opinions expressed in the adaptation are the sole responsibility of the author or authors of the adaptation and are not endorsed by The World Bank.*

Third-party content—The World Bank does not necessarily own each component of the content contained within the work. The World Bank therefore does not warrant that the use of any third-party-owned individual component or part contained in the work will not infringe on the rights of those third parties. The risk of claims resulting from such infringement rests solely with you. If you wish to reuse a component of the work, it is your responsibility to determine whether permission is needed for that reuse and to obtain permission from the copyright owner. Examples of components can include, but are not limited to, tables, figures, or images.

All queries on rights and licenses should be addressed to World Bank Publications, The World Bank Group, 1818 H Street NW, Washington, DC 20433, USA; e-mail: pubrights@worldbank.org.

ISBN (paper): 978-1-4648-1438-9

ISBN (electronic): 978-1-4648-1439-6

DOI: 10.1596/978-1-4648-1438-9

SKU: 211438

Cover photos: Bankruptcy Court Courthouse, Dayton, Ohio: © StanRohrer / iStock by Getty Images. Used with permission of StanRohrer / iStock by Getty Images. Further permission required for reuse. Magnifying glass and gavel: © designer491 / iStock by Getty Images. Used with permission of designer491 / iStock by Getty Images. Further permission required for reuse.

Cover design: Debra Naylor, Naylor Design, Washington, DC.

Library of Congress Control Number: 2019916683

418901

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>About the Authors</i>	<i>xi</i>
<i>Abbreviations</i>	<i>xiii</i>
<i>Glossary</i>	<i>xv</i>
Introduction	1
Objective	3
Scope	4
Methodology	5
Overview of Chapters	5
Notes	6
References	7
1. Insolvency Proceedings and Representatives	9
Moratorium	12
Appointment of an Insolvency Representative	12
The Different Authorities that May Appoint Insolvency Representatives	13
Specific Rules and Practices for an Insolvent Bank	15
Effects of the Appointment of an Insolvency Representative	15
Cross-Border Recognition and Conducting Insolvency Actions Abroad	17
Powers of Insolvency Representatives in Asset Recovery	21
Tools Available to Collect Information and Evidence	21
Legal Actions that Authorize Insolvency Representatives to Claim Assets	22
Notes	25
References	26
2. Investigative Measures Potentially Available in Insolvency and Civil Cases	29
Extrajudicial Investigative Tools	29
Discovery Databases as a Source of Information	30
Examination of Witnesses under Standard Insolvency Practices	31
Targets of Examination	31
Range of Examination	33
Use of Information	35
Costs of Examination	36

Discovery	36
Nonstatutory Tools	36
Anton Piller (Search and Seizure) Orders	36
<i>Norwich Pharmacal</i> (Disclosure) Orders in Common Law Jurisdictions	38
Ancillary Sealing and Gagging Orders	42
Other Investigative Tools	44
Mareva Injunctions and Mareva by Letter in Common Law Jurisdictions	44
Freezing Orders in Civil Law Jurisdictions	44
Discovery in Aid of Foreign Proceedings	45
Notes	46
Reference	47
 3. Identifying Insolvency and Receivership Targets and Other Liable Persons in Corruption Cases	 49
Bribe Takers and Related Entities	49
Bribe Payers and Related Entities	52
Agents and Other Facilitators	52
Strategic and Tactical Considerations	54
Claims against Corporate Officers, Agents, and Third-Party Facilitators	54
The Duties of Directors and Managers of Companies	55
Personal Liability Actions against Directors	59
Proceedings for Fraudulent or Wrongful Trading	59
Preferences and Transactions at Undervalue	60
Other Breaches of Duty	61
Derivative Actions	62
Piercing the Corporate Veil	62
Notes	68
References	69
 4. Privilege	 71
Privilege in England	71
Forms of Privilege at Common Law	71
Common Interest Privilege	72
Which Law Applies?	73
Waiver	73
Insolvency	73
Privilege in the United States	76
Corporate Insolvency	76
Personal Insolvency	76
Professional Secrecy in France	77
Scope and Application of the Professional Secret	77
Sanctions for Violation of Professional Secrecy by an Attorney	77
Issues Relating to Corporate Insolvency and Bankruptcy Proceedings	77
Issues Relating to Individual Insolvency	78
Conclusion	78
Notes	79

5. Further Issues on the Use of Insolvency for Asset Recovery	81
Major Challenges for Asset Recovery in Developing Jurisdictions	81
Commencement Obstacles	81
Unregulated or Insufficiently Regulated Insolvency Representatives	82
Ineffective or Nonexistent Anti-Avoidance System	82
Slow, Unresponsive, or Inexperienced Judicial Systems and Lawyers	82
Ineffective or Nonexistent Collateral Registry Systems	83
Impediments to Enforcement	84
Transparency and Accountability of Legal Insolvency Frameworks	84
Recognition and Use of Laws and Proceedings in Cross-Border Insolvency	84
The UNCITRAL Model Law on Cross-Border Insolvency	84
United Kingdom Cross-Border Insolvency Regulations 2006	88
International and Institutional Considerations	89
International Considerations	89
The Conflict between State Confiscation of Criminal Assets and Insolvency Proceedings	91
Notes	98
References	101
 Appendix A. Country-Specific Regulations for Insolvency Representatives	 103
Notes	122
 Appendix B. Website Resources	 123
International Organizations and Bodies	123
World Bank Group	123
Stolen Asset Recovery (StAR) Initiative	123
United Nations	123
United Nations Commission on International Trade Law	123
Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development	
Convention on Combating Bribery of Foreign Public Officials in International Business	123
Organizations, Rating Agencies, and Bar Associations that Track Asset Recovery Attorneys	124
Online Sources for Case Law	124
 Boxes	
I.1 Case Study on the Appointment of Insolvency Representatives	2
1.1 World Bank Principle C4.2: Commencement	9
1.2 Just and Equitable Winding Up	10
1.3 Using Insolvency Proceedings in Asset Recovery	11
1.4 World Bank Principle D7: Role of Regulatory or Supervisory Bodies	14
1.5 World Bank Principle D8: Competence and Integrity of Insolvency Representatives	14
1.6 Overview of the Powers of an Insolvency Representative	16

1.7	U.K. Supreme Court Rules on Cross-Border Insolvencies: The Limits of Universalism in <i>Rubin v. Eurofinance S.A.</i>	18
1.8	U.S. Court Grants Recognition of Former Russian Business Owner's Bankruptcy	20
1.9	World Bank Principle C11: Avoidable Transactions	23
2.1	<i>Crumpler ex rel. Global Tradewaves Ltd. v. Global Tradewaves, in re Global Tradewaves Ltd.</i>	33
2.2	<i>Clarke v. Bank of Nova Scotia Jamaica Ltd.</i>	41
2.3	<i>Marcus A. Wide v. FirstCaribbean International Bank</i>	43
3.1	Case Study on Just and Equitable Winding Up and the Appointment of an Insolvency Representative— <i>Montrow International Ltd.</i>	51
3.2	<i>Kirschner v. KPMG LLP and Teachers' Retirement System of Louisiana v. PricewaterhouseCoopers, LLP</i>	53
3.3	Case Study on the Principle of the "Controlling Mind"	56
3.4	World Bank Principle B2—Directors' Obligations in the Period Approaching Insolvency	58
3.5	<i>Prest v. Petrodel Resources Ltd.</i>	63
3.6	<i>Wood v. Baker</i>	64
3.7	<i>Bankruptcy Estate of Petroforte v. Securinvest Holdings S.A.</i>	65
3.8	<i>Bankruptcy Estate of Mabe Brasil v. Mabe/General Electric/Penteado Family</i>	65
3.9	<i>MMX Sudeste under reorganization v. Batista</i>	66
5.1	World Bank Principle C15: International Considerations	89
5.2	World Bank Principle D1: Implementation—Institutional and Regulatory Frameworks	90
5.3	World Bank Principles and Best Practices	90
5.4	The Stanford International Bank (in Liquidation)	92
5.5	SK Foods LP	95
5.6	Banco Santos	97